The East-West Center in Washington invites you to an Asia Pacific Security Seminar:

**Failing to Deliver:**
**Defense Reforms in India**

Featuring:
Mr. Anit Mukherjee
Research Fellow, Institute for Defence Studies and Analyses (IDSA), New Delhi

and Discussant:
Dr. Stephen P. Cohen
Senior Fellow, Foreign Policy Studies Program, The Brookings Institution
• Early 1990’s: Post crises self-examination
• The NSC experiment
• The debates
• . . .
• . . .
• BJP government: The nuclear BOOM
• Sinking of the Admiral
• A summer war
The Kargil Review Committee

- Interviewed senior political, bureaucratic, military and intel officers
- Recommended complete over-haul of defense apparatus
- Criticized as it was not an enquiry and did not affix blame
- Public version allowed unprecedented debate
The Arun Singh Committee

• Pace of change
• Consensus committee
• Non-integration of MOD with service HQ
• Flawed historiography
Implementation of the reforms

• The Chief of Defence Staff (CDS)

• Integration of MOD with Service Headquarters

• Functioning of newly created organizations: Integrated Defence Staff (IDS), Defence Intelligence Agency (DIA), Andaman and Nicobar Command (ANC)
## Main Recommendations of the Arun Singh Committee

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Recommendations that were implemented</th>
<th>Recommendations not implemented</th>
<th>Recommendations imperfectly implemented</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Creation of additional tri-services organizations like IDS, ANC, DIA and SFC.</td>
<td>1. Creation of the Chief of Defence Staff (CDS) position.</td>
<td>1. Functioning of tri-services organisations like IDS, ANC and DIA.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Increased transparency in weapons procurement process.</td>
<td>2. Publication of war histories and declassification</td>
<td>2. Overall integration and jointness within the Indian armed forces.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Lowering of age profile of officers.</td>
<td>3. Non-inclusion of military representative in the pay commission.</td>
<td>3. Defence planning procedures.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Delegation of financial powers to the services.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Why?

• Deliberate subversion

• Incapacity

• Growing pangs
The Absent Dialogue: Civil-military relations in India

- Politicians, lacking knowledge, rarely interfere.
- Lack of civilian expertise plus strong bureaucratic control plus generalist bureaucracy.
- Autonomy within the military, but lacking directions.
Conclusion

• Groundhog day: Fresh demand for reforms

• The Goldilocks crisis

• Leadership

• Professional emulation

anitm@yahoo.com